

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

September 27, 2018

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER, ROOM 309 – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Andrew Shveda
Randolph Bloom
Robyn Conroy
Diane Long
Janet Theerman
Mark Wamback

Commission Members Absent: Devon Kurtz
Courtney Ross Escobar, Alternate
Tomi Stefani, Alternate

Staff Members Present: Susan Arena, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services
Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Call Commission to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chair Shveda at 5:30 pm.

Approval of Minutes

Review of the August 30, 2018 minutes.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback the Commission voted 5-0 to approve the minutes of August 30, 2018.

Old Business

1. 75 Chatham (aka 18 Crown) Street – HC-2018-064 (MBL 03-024-00020)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness
Petitioner: Michael Kline
Present Use: Multi-family residence
Year Built: c1850
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register listed, and located within the Crown Hill
Local Historic District, fka the Martin Stowe – Thomas B Eaton House
Petition Purpose:

- Replace asphalt and slate roof (partially retroactive)

Taken out of order.

Michael Kline, owner, and Mark Billings, contractor, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda reviewed the previous meeting stating that the Commission had asked for additional information and pricing. Mr. Kline stated that Mr. Billings is a new contractor to the job and provided numbers for each roofing option.

Chair Shveda read into the record a letter submitted by John Towns.

Reviewing the quotes provided by Mr. Billings Chair Shveda stated that the price for slate would be \$67,700; for composite slate would be \$57,700; and for asphalt shingles would be \$17,000. The discrepancy between asphalt and the other two options was largely due to labor costs as both slate and composite would need to be installed one tile at a time.

Chair Shveda reminded the applicant that as his building is located in a Local Historic District so they are reviewing what is most appropriate for the district. He noted that the biggest hiccup in this review is that most of the roofing material had already been removed.

Mr. Rolle reviewed the definitions of Certificate of Hardship and Certificate of Appropriateness, which apply within Local Historic Districts. Chair Shveda confirmed with the applicant that his first choice would be the GAF Timberline asphalt shingles. Mr. Kline agreed and stated that he doesn't have a second choice, stating that he couldn't afford those. Mr. Billings noted that if he had to do either slate or composite he doesn't know if he could get it completed this year. The Commission reviewed property costs as provided by Mr. Kline, including monthly income and expenses.

Chair Shveda again expressed frustration at the situation, specifically calling out the lack of professionalism shown by the original contractors and the need to adhere to the City's regulations.

The Commission reviewed the samples of the three roofing materials. Ms. Arena asked whether the lower roofs on the porches will be reroofed to match the main part. Mr. Billings stated that they would. Commissioner Long observed that the composite slate didn't seem worth the money in her opinion and doesn't seem like a very good material. Chair Shveda expressed preference for the dark grey color asphalt shingle, but was still dissatisfied that the shape more closely resembled wood shake than slate.

Public comment: Jo Hart, Worcester, stated that we should petition the city or state to contribute a certain amount of money to help keep properties decent. If you take off a slate roof you've lost everything.

Julie Downen, Worcester, stated that the Community Preservation Act would help in this sort of situation.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 0-5 that the proposed changes at 75 Chatham Street, consisting of the installation of GAF Timberline asphalt shingles, are appropriate to the Crown Hill Local Historic District, and denied the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-1 (Commissioner Bloom voting against) that the installation of slate or composite slate roofing would pose a substantial hardship on the applicant, and approved the Certificate of Hardship.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 0-5 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 75 Chatham Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-1 (Commissioner Bloom voting against) that the installation of slate or composite slate would

pose an undue economic hardship on the application, and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated August 8, 2018 and received August 13, 2018.

Exhibit B: Letter submitted by Gerald Scher dated August 26, 2018 and received August 27, 2018.

Exhibit C: Letter from John Towns dated September 14, 2018 and received September 19, 2018.

Exhibit D: Request to Continue form, dated September 13, 2018.

2. 31 Louise Street – HC-2018-052 (MBL 10-005-00020)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Adnan Terms
Present Use: Three-family residence
Year Built: c1916
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the John and Edward Johnson Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Demolish front three-story porch and rebuild first floor only
- Install vinyl siding

Applicant requested to continue to the October 11, 2018 meeting so that his contractor could attend.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to the October 11, 2018 meeting and extend the constructive grant deadline to October 15, 2018.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 16, 2018 and received July 16, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request to continue form, dated August 29, 2018.

Exhibit C: Request to continue form, dated September 27, 2018.

Commissioner Bloom left.

New Business

3. 2 Oread (aka 805 Main) Street – HC-2018-066 (MBL 06-029-18+25)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Worcester Community Housing Resources
Present Use: Mixed-use building
Year Built: c1876
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, fka the Addison Macullar House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace roof
- Repair associated trim

Jini Henderson, Worcester Community Housing Resources, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda reviewed the application stating that the work appeared to all be like for like. Ms. Henderson confirmed that the asphalt roof will be replaced in its entirety. The trim will likely be mostly untouched, but any rotted areas will be replaced in wood to match.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 2 Oread Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated August 14, 2018 and received August 28, 2018.

4. 215 Harding Street – HC-2018-068 (MBL 04-022-00006)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Baystate Investment Fund, LLC
Present Use: Commercial building
Year Built: c1910
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and located within a National Register Historic District, fka the Lewis Goldstein Apartment House
Petition Purpose:

- Replace windows
- Rebuild storefront

Taken out of order. Applicant for 41 Plantation Street had to leave unexpectedly.

Edward Murphy, owner, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Murphy explained that his company had recently purchased the Weintraub's building and they'd like to bring the rear storefront, facing Harding Street, back into service. The space is currently vacant. Windows overlooking the parking lot are wood, residential units that they'd like to replace with black aluminum frame units. The goal is to create a look similar to the storefront at 64 Water Street, which the company recently completed. Chair Shveda stated that the only intact historic portion appeared to be the crown over the door. Mr. Murphy agreed that they'd like to restore it if possible, but noted rot so it would likely need to be replicated in wood or Azek. This option was acceptable to the Commission. He also stated that the windows facing Harding Street are in various states of disrepair, with one missing altogether.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 215 Harding Street is not

detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated August 23, 2018 and received September 6, 2018.

5. 41 Plantation Street – HC-2018-067 (MBL 18-004-00014)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: John Kelly
Present Use: Three-family residence
Year Built: c1916
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register listed, fka the Edna-Stolliker Three-Decker
Petition Purpose:

- Replace roof

The applicant had to leave unexpectedly, so Ms. Arena presented the application as she understood it.

The roof is currently two layers of asphalt shingle installed over slate. Due to the height of the building, the siting, and the pitch of the roof it is minimally visible from the street. The applicant would like to strip all layers off and replace with asphalt shingles. Chair Shveda noted that minor repairs related to the reroofing would also be acceptable.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Conroy the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 41 Plantation Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated September 5, 2018 and received September 6, 2018.

Communications

- a. Communication from MHC re: Section 106 review of Union Station, 2 Washington Square – dated September 11, 2018 and received September 14, 2018.

No comment.

- b. *Request for new Letter of Support from MHA Northeast re: Tax credit application for Elwood Adams Block, 156 Main Street – received electronically September 14, 2018.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Conroy the Commission voted 5-0 to issue a letter of support for 156 Main Street.

- c. Communication from Preservation Massachusetts re: Informational postcard – received September 14, 2018.

No comment.

- d. Communication from FCC re: Section 106 filing for 100 Front Street – dated September 19, 2018 and received September 24, 2018.

No comment.

Other Business

I. Demolition Delay Waiver application revision

The Commission reviewed and commented on draft revisions presented by Ms. Arena. Suggestions will be incorporated and recirculated for review at the next meeting.

Adjournment

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to adjourn the meeting at 8:10 p.m.